

Larry McClung
SLIS 5223
Spring 2005

Introduction

This assignment involves the creation of metadata records for five separate electronic documents using two distinct schemes: ERC (Electronic Resource Citation) and DCMI (Dublin Core Metadata Initiative). By employing each of these schemes in turn in an attempt to describe a diverse group of documents, one is able to vividly see the fundamental differences between the two schemes and weigh their relative strengths and weaknesses. Here are the accumulated records, grouped by method, followed by a discussion of the issues that emerged from the experience, and a few concluding remarks.

Electronic Resource Citation Records

Record 1

erc:

who: Baca, Murtha

what: Introduction to Metadata: Pathways to Digital Information

when: 2003

where: http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/

erc:

who/created: The Getty Standards and Digital Resources Management Program

who/created: J. Paul Getty Trust.

what/about: A program that works to enhance access to information on the visual arts and related disciplines by promoting standards and practices and developing tools and guidelines for developing, managing, preserving, and delivering information in electronic form.

erc:

who: Baca, Murtha

what: Introduction.

when: 2003

where: http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/1_introduction/

erc:

who: Gilliland-Swetland, Anne J.

what: Setting the Stage

when: 2000 07 05

where: http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/2_articles/index.html

erc:

who: Gill, Tony

what: Metadata and the World Wide Web

when: 2000 07 05

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/2_articles/gill/index.html

erc:

who: Woodley, Mary

what: Crosswalks: the Path to Universal Access?

when: 2000 07 05

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/2_articles/woodley/index.html

erc:

who: Baca, Murtha

who: Gilliland-Sweatland, Anne

who: Harpring, Patricia

who: Woodley, Mary

what: Metadata Standards Crosswalk

what/about: Graphic display of crosswalk between nine different metadata standards.

when: 2000 07 11

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/3_crosswalks/index.html

erc:

who: Woodley, Mary

what: Glossary

when: 2000 07 05

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/4_glossary/index.html

erc:

what: Acronyms Used in this Guide, with selected Uniform Resource Locators.

when: 2000 07 05

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/5_acronyms/index.html

erc:

what: Contributors

when: 2000 07 05

where:http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/6_contributors/index.html

Record 2

erc:
who: UKOLN
what: Metadata
when: 2005 01 18
where: <http://www.ukoln.ac.uk/metadata/>

erc:
who/created: Day, Michael
who/created: Powell, Andy
what/created: Metadata information page.
what/about: Provides links to metadata projects, resources, tutorials, initiatives, and registries

erc:
who: UKOLN
what/about: A centre of expertise in digital information management based at the University of Bath.
what/purpose: Provides advice and services to the library, information, education, and cultural heritage communities.

Record 3

erc:
who: National Information Standards Organization
what: The Dublin Core Metadata Element Set
when: 2001 09 10
where: <http://www.niso.org/standards/resources/Z39-85.pdf?CFID=179761&CFTOKEN=46984796>

erc:
who/published: NISO
what/ID: ANSI/NISO z39.85-2001
what/ID: ISSN: 1041-5653
when/copyright: 2001
where/published: NISO Press/Bethesda, Maryland

erc:
what/about: Brief statement of the scope, purpose, definitions, and description of the basic Dublin Core 15 element metadata set.

Record 4

erc:

who: Medlane Project

what: XOBIS: The XML Organic Bibliographic Information Schema

when: 2003 10 22

where: <http://laneweb.stanford.edu:2380/wiki/medlane/schema>

Note: This is the introductory page from which the XOBIS schema and sample records may be accessed.

erc:

who/created: Miller, Dick R.

who/created: Clarke, Kevin S.

what/created: text of XOBIS: The XML Organic Bibliographic Information Schema

when/created: 2002 04--2002 09

where/created: Lane Medical Library, Stanford University

where/accessed: <http://laneweb.stanford.edu:2380/wiki/medlane/schema>

Record 5

erc:

who: Lynch, Clifford A.

what: Metadata Harvesting and the Open Archives Initiative

when: 2001 08

where: <http://www.arl.org/newsltr/217/mhp.html>

erc:

who/author: Executive Director, Coalition for Networked Information

what/about: A description of the Open Archives Metadata Harvesting Protocol, an important new support for distributed networked information services.

where/sourced: ARL Bimonthly Report 217

Dublin Core Records

Record 1

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Introduction to Metadata: Pathways to Digital Information">

<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Baca, Murtha">

<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata">

<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="An electronic document containing an introduction, three articles, a glossary, graphs, and biographical information about the contributors.">

<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="J. Paul Getty Trust">

<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Gilliland-Swetland, Anne; Gill, Tony; Woodley, Mary">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/">
 <META NAME="DC.Language" LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
 <META NAME="DC.Coverage" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-2003">
 <META NAME="DC.Rights" LANG="en" CONTENT="Copyright 2003. J. Paul Getty Trust">

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Introduction">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Baca, Murtha">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A brief introduction to the document and its various contributors.">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2003">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/1_introduction/">
 <META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Setting the Stage">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Gilliland-Swetland, Anne J.">
 <META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata is defined and its importance for describing the content, context, and structure of information objects is explained.">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/2_articles/index.html/">
 <META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata and the World Wide Web">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Gill, Tony">
 <META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata/cataloging/World Wide Web">

```

<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="This is a vigorous
discussion of the need for widely supported standards in order to maximize the utility of
metadata in organizing information on the World Wide Web.">
<META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
<CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/standards/intrometadata/pdf/gill.pdf/">
META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">
http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadata/2_articles/gil
l/index.html

```

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Crosswalks: the Path to
Universal Access?">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Woodley, Mary">
<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata
Standards/Crosswalks">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="An exploration of the
value of crosswalks between metadata standards as the most realistic way to enable
simultaneous searching of heterogeneous databases.">
<META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadat
a/2_articles/woodley/index.html ">
<META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

```

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata Standards
Crosswalk">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Baca, Murtha">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Gilliland-Swetland, Anne">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Harpring, Patricia">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Woodley, Mary">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A tabular description of
the crosswalks between different elements found in nine metadata standards.">
<META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-11">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadat
a/3_crosswalks/index.html">
<META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Glossary">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadat
 a/4_glossary/index.html">

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Acronyms Used in this Guide,
 with selected Uniform Resource Locators">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="An alphabetical listing of
 acronyms with full text definition of all and URLs for some.">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadat
 a/5_acronyms/index.html">
 <META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Contributors">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A brief biography of the
 editor and main contributors is provided on this page.">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2000-07-05">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.getty.edu/research/conducting_research/standards/intrometadat
 a/6_contributors/index.html">
 <META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="IsPartOf ">

Record 2

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="UKOLN">
 <META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A web page maintained
 by UKOLN, a British centre of expertise in digital information management.">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="This web page provides
 links to metadata projects, resources, tutorials, initiatives, and registries.">
 <META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="University of Bath,
 England">
 <META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Day, Michael">
 <META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Powell, Andy">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2005-01-18">

<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.ukoln.ac.uk/metadata/">
 <META NAME="DC.Relation" LANG="en" CONTENT="One of many subjects
 accessed from the main page of UKOLN.">
 <META NAME="DC.Language" LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
 <META NAME="DC.Rights" LANG="en" CONTENT="http://www.ukoln.ac.uk/">

Record 3

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="The Dublin Core Metadata
 Element Set">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="National Information
 Standards Organization">
 <META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Dublin Core Metadata
 Initiative">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A brief history of the
 development of the Dublin Core Metadata Initiative, the involvement of NISO members,
 followed by a discussion of the scope and purpose of DCMI and a brief explanation of
 the 15 DC elements.">
 <META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="National Information
 Standards Organization">
 <META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2001-09-10">
 <META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
 <META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
 CONTENT="http://www.niso.org/standards/resources/Z39-
 85.pdf?CFID=179761&CFTOKEN=46984796">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en" CONTENT="ISSN 1041-5653">
 <META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en" CONTENT="ISBN 1-880124-53-X">
 <META NAME="DC.Language" LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
 <META NAME="DC.Rights" LANG="en" CONTENT="Copyright 2001 by the
 National Information Standards Organization">

Record 4

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="XOBIS: The XML Organic
 Bibliographic Information Schema">
 <META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Medlane Project">
 <META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="XML scheme">
 <META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A new XML scheme for
 reorganizing and describing the full set of library information.">
 <META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="Lane Medical Library,
 Stanford University">

```

<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Miller, Dick R.">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Clarke, Kevin S.">
<META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2003-10-22">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://laneweb.stanford.edu:2380/wiki/medlane/schema/">
<META NAME="DC.Language" LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
<META NAME="DC.Rights" LANG="en" CONTENT="Copyright 2002 Lane Medical
Library, Stanford University">

```

Record 5

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata Harvesting and the
Open Archives Initiative">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" LANG="en" CONTENT="Lynch, Clifford A.">
<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata/System
Architecture/Networked Information">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="The article describes an
important new infrastructure component for supporting distributed networked
information services.">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="ARL Bimonthly Report">
<META NAME="DC.Date" LANG="en" CONTENT="2001 08">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.arl.org/newsltr/217/mhp.html/">
<META NAME="DC.Source" LANG="en" CONTENT="ARL Bimonthly Report 217">
<META NAME="DC.Language" LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
<META NAME="DC.Rights" LANG="en" CONTENT="Copyright The Association of
Research Libraries">

```

Discussion

The records shown above were created with the help of a text-editor called NoteTab. In working with the ERC records I very quickly concluded that it takes more time and effort to highlight and double-click on a left-column menu item, type in the data, and click OK, than to simply type out the words who, what, when, and where. So after a short while I quit using the text-editor's feature of allowing me to select the tag from the menu. When I got to the DC records, it was quite a different story. By contrast to ERC, the DC fifteen elements seemed complex. I was grateful to have the help of the text editor as I worked my way through the list of possible elements, making my choices, then having the editor add the html tags as I inputted data. That saved a lot of labor. A text editor like NoteTab is clearly useful when working with the Dublin Core scheme.

For the ERC scheme, it would be more useful to have an editor that simply input the terms ‘erc:’, ‘who:’, etc. with one keystroke.

The most appealing feature of the ERC scheme is its flexibility. One can create all sorts of qualifiers to make the basic labels more precise: what/about, who/created, erc-support, and the like. This makes it appealing to people with a creative flair. The DC fifteen element scheme seems rigid by contrast. Also, I found myself uncertain how to interpret the elements: Source, Relation, and Coverage. It’s easy to image using ‘Source’ to describe a book that the document being described came from, but what about a web page? Is the “Metadata” page on the UKOLN site a smaller part of a larger entity? Since it can be accessed from a menu found on the general (home?) page of UKOLN, I assume that is the case. But, the relationships between interlinked web pages are not as obvious and clear as taking a chapter out of a book or, as with the Clifford Lynch article, posting on the web an article that previously appeared in a journal or newsletter.

In the brief definition of the element ‘Relation’ found in the ANSI/NISO paper, we are advised to “identify the referenced resource by means of a string or number conforming to a formal identification system.” Does that mean a catalog number, an ISBN number, or a URL? This sounds rather vague to me and I assumed none of the five information objects described in the records above need to be identified in this way.

The element ‘Coverage’ appears to apply in situations when the object being described is part of a serial or some sort of publication that contains over a span of time that can be identified with parameters: 2001-2005, April, 2004-September, 2004, etc. Is it possible that web pages that show copyright dates that span several years qualify for this label? The only thing I saw in the five records described above that might clearly qualify for a ‘Coverage’ description was the 99-page general scheme for XOBIS, which was produced over a period of several months. This paper is so interesting and so important to understanding what is talked about on the opening page of the XOBIS site, I felt it needed mention in the record. But, if we describe that, what about other parts of the Medlane Project? I was rather uncertain what to do on that. I looked at the various links that described the Medlane Project but limited my record to the main page and a reference to the XOBIS general scheme paper.

Despite the ambiguities in some of the DC elements, I prefer this scheme to the ERC. With the DC records I felt like I was being guided to create a more consistent and comprehensive record, one more likely to be standardized, than I was when working with the ERC scheme.

Summary

One of the most interesting aspects of this exercise was that the five documents presented for description were themselves valuable sources of information pertaining to the topic at hand. No doubt this was intentional, a clever method by which our esteemed professor got us to read additional information we might otherwise have passed over. That made the exercise doubly rewarding. My anxiety about creating the metadata records quickly dissipated once I finally set fingers to keyboard and gave it a shot. It was a relatively painless experience. In the process I also enjoyed reading the material I was being asked to describe. The multi-faceted document from the J. Paul Getty trust was

very well presented and I found it interesting to work back to the general page that describes what the Getty people are up to. That led me to other resources that may be useful in the future. The ANSI/NISO document is valuable for its succinct description of the history of the DCMI and the intended method of applying the 15 elements.

XOBIS stands out as an exciting new development that is being presented in a very lively and engaging fashion. I ended up printing out all 99 pages of the scheme and have already read a good bit of it. Maybe it will help me understand and appreciate XML.

In general, the five documents assigned represented a good cross-section of types of electronic documents. Each has its own unique features, some more challenging to describe than others. The diversity of tasks involved made for a useful and enjoyable exercise.