

Creating Metadata Records

Introduction

This paper will describe and discuss the process of creating metadata records for five web-based resources. A total of ten metadata records, five using the Electronic Resource Citation (ERC) metadata scheme and five using the Dublin Core (DC) metadata scheme will be examined and a discussion about the thought processes behind their creation will be explained. A discussion of their advantages and disadvantages will also be presented.

Electronic Resource Citation Records

[Metadata Demystified: A Guide for Publishers](#). by Amy Brand, Frank Daly, and Barbara Meyers. 2003.

who: Brand, Amy | Daly, Frank | Meyers, Barbara
what: Metadata Demystified: A Guide for Publishers
when: 2003
where: http://www.niso.org/standards/resources/Metadata_Demystified.pdf

Canadian Heritage Information Networked (CHIN). [Metadata Standards for Museum Cataloguing](#).

who: Canadian Heritage Information Networked (CHIN)
what: Metadata Standards for Museum Cataloguing
when: 2002
where: http://www.chin.gc.ca/English/Standards/metadata_description.html

[Using Dublin Core](#). Diane Hillman. 2003.

who: Hillman, Diane
what: Using Dublin Core
when: 2003
where: <http://dublincore.org/documents/usageguide/>

[XML Software](#) [Website]. 2003.

who: Tauber, James | van den Brink, Linda | van Oven, Barry
what: XML Software
when: 1998
where: <http://www.xmlsoftware.com/>

[International Metadata Initiatives: Lessons in Bibliographic Control](#). Priscilla Caplan. 2000.

who: Caplan, Priscilla
what: International Metadata Initiatives: Lessons in Bibliographic Control
when: 2000
where: http://lcweb.loc.gov/catdir/bibcontrol/caplan_paper.html

Dublin Core Records

[Metadata Demystified: A Guide for Publishers.](#) by Amy Brand, Frank Daly, and Barbara Meyers. 2003.

```
<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata Demystified: A Guide for
Publishers">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Brand, Amy">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Daly, Frank">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Meyers, Barbara">
<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="This guide presents an overview of
evolving metadata conventions in publishing, as well as related initiatives designed to
standardize how metadata is structured and disseminated online.">
<META NAME="DC.Language" SCHEME="RFC1766"
LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="The Sheridan Press">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="NISO Press">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Harris, Pat">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Parente, Susan">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Pirkey, Kevin">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Suprock, Greg">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Witowski, Mark">
<META NAME="DC.Date" SCHEME="ISO8601" LANG="en" CONTENT="2003-07">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="Portable Document Format">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="URI" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.niso.org/standards/resources/Metadata_Demystified.pdf">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="ISBN" LANG="en" CONTENT="ISBN 1-880124-59-
9">
```

Canadian Heritage Information Networked (CHIN). [Metadata Standards for Museum Cataloguing.](#)

```
<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="Metadata Standards for Museum
Cataloguing"><META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Canadian
Heritage Information Network ">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Government of Canada,
Canadian Heritage">
<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A metadata standards guide that
enables museum data to be efficiently and consistently indexed, sorted, retrieved, and shared,
both in automated and paper-based systems for the Canadian Heritage Information Network
Museum.">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="Government of Canada, Canadian
Heritage">
<META NAME="DC.Date" SCHEME="ISO8601" LANG="en" CONTENT="2002-04-27">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="URI" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.chin.gc.ca/English/Standards/metadata_discovery.html#dublin_core"
>
<META NAME="DC.Language" SCHEME="RFC1766"
LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
```

[Using Dublin Core.](#) Diane Hillman. 2003.

```
<meta name="DC.title" content="Using Dublin Core" />
```

```

<meta name="DC.creator" content="Diane Hillmann" />
<meta name="DC.description" content="This document is intended as an entry point for users
of Dublin Core. For non-specialists, it will assist them in creating simple descriptive records for
information resources (for example, electronic documents). Specialists may find the document
a useful point of reference to the documentation of Dublin Core, as it changes and grows." />
<meta name="DC.publisher" content="Dublin Core Metadata Initiative" />
<META NAME="DC.Date" SCHEME="ISO8601" LANG="en" CONTENT="2003-08-26">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="URI" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://dublincore.org/documents/usageguide/">
<META NAME="DC.Language" SCHEME="RFC1766"
LANG="en" CONTENT="en">
content="Dublin Core Metadata Initiative" />

```

[XML Software](#) [Website]. 2003.

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="XML Software">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="van den Brink, Linda">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Tauber, James">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="van Oven, Barry">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="A website containing information
and links to applications for the creation of XML (Extensible Markup Language) documents.">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="van den Brink, Linda">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="Tauber, James">
<META NAME="DC.Contributor" LANG="en" CONTENT="van Oven, Barry">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="URI" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.xmlsoftware.com/index.html">
<META NAME="DC.Language" SCHEME="RFC1766"
LANG="en" CONTENT="en">

```

[International Metadata Initiatives: Lessons in Bibliographic Control](#). Priscilla Caplan. 2000.

```

<META NAME="DC.Title" LANG="en" CONTENT="International Metadata Initiatives: Lessons in
Bibliographic Control ">
<META NAME="DC.Creator" SCHEME="LCNA" LANG="en" CONTENT="Caplan, Priscilla">
<META NAME="DC.Description" LANG="en" CONTENT="It is the aim of this conference to
bring together authorities in the cataloging and metadata communities to discuss outstanding
issues involving improved discovery and access to Web resources within the framework of
international standards. The focus of the conference is on an open discussion of the issues
with primary attention on proposed solutions and action items which result.">
<META NAME="DC.Subject" LANG="en" CONTENT="bibliographic control millennium
challenges network resource ">
<META NAME="DC.Publisher" LANG="en" CONTENT="Library of Congress">
<META NAME="DC.Date" SCHEME="ISO8601" LANG="en" CONTENT="2001-01-23">
<META NAME="DC.Type" LANG="en" CONTENT="text">
<META NAME="DC.Format" LANG="en" CONTENT="text/html">
<META NAME="DC.Identifier" SCHEME="URI" LANG="en"
CONTENT="http://www.loc.gov/catdir/bibcontrol/caplan_paper.html">
<META NAME="DC.Language" SCHEME="
RFC1766"
LANG="en" CONTENT="en">

```

Discussion

Metadata Demystified: A Guide for Publishers. By Amy Brand, Frank Daly, and Barbara Meyers. 2003.

All three authors mentioned in this reference were attributed to the ERC element set "who", and as "Creators" in DC. The five additional contributors listed in the article were recognized as such in DC but not in ERC because that metadata scheme did not contain a "contributor" element set and because the "story" concept in ERC was not fully grasped at the time of its creation. In retrospect, an ERC qualifier should have been assigned to each contributor in this article as well.

This information object is actually a hyperlink to a .PDF document on a web server, so the article URL was used as the ERC element set "where", and the "format" attribute as a "portable document format" in DC. After closer inspection of the document, an ISBN number was noticed and assigned as an additional DC "identifier" element set. The DC "description" element set was copied directly from the introduction to the paper as were most of the descriptions to all the resources mentioned in this paper with the exception one which will be discussed later.

Canadian Heritage Information Networked (CHIN). Metadata Standards for Museum Cataloguing.

This resource was interesting because of its date inconsistencies. The date of creation in the webpage source code was different than the date displayed at the bottom of the webpage, as was the "modified date" which had not been updated in the source code. The date at the bottom of the webpage was used for the "when" ERC element set because it seemed to be the most accurate. English was assigned to the "language" DC element set because that was the language that was displayed in the webpage. However, this was a Canadian website that also had a French language "mirror" site. Including a "French" language element set was considered but abandoned because the reference "points" only to the English section of the website. Two creators were assigned in the DC record because the webpage source code credits the Government of Canada, Canadian Heritage as the creator although the entity responsible for the creation of the material seemed to be the Canadian Heritage Information Network Museum. The Government of Canada, Canadian Heritage was assigned as the DC "publisher".

Using Dublin Core. Diane Hillman. 2003.

This website's metadata record was the easiest to create because the HTML source code and an associated .RDF record provided most of the DC record information, as it should, because it is adhering to the standard that it is promoting. The ERC "anchoring story" was straight forward, though; qualifiers should probably have been included in this record as well.

XML Software [Website]. 2003.

The XML Software website was the most troublesome resource encountered during this assignment. Firstly, the only evidence that could be found as to who created the page was a personal note to visitors to the website by Linda van den Brink. In the note, she mentions two more contributors, but does not mention the level of their involvement, so all three were credited in the "who" ERC element set and as "creator" in DC. Because there

was no apparent differentiation between the three contributor's roles, all three were assigned as "contributor" in DC as well.

Secondly, the "description" DC element was not found in the webpage HTML source code so a description had to be written, which exposes an inherent disadvantage to DC: How can someone unfamiliar with a specific subject accurately describe an information object without referring to the creator or someone with expertise in that particular subject?

Lastly, the website's creation date wasn't apparent. The only dates that appeared on the webpage were update notifications and news items, so the only way to verify a creation date was to consult another resource, www.networksolutions.com, to determine when the domain name was registered. Still, this information is not totally reliable since the date the domain was registered may not necessarily be the same as the "go live" date or the date that the webpage was created which exposes another dilemma: If an element set cannot be confidently verified, should it be included in a metadata record? To avoid creating an "incomplete" record, the registration date was included, with reservations, in the ERC record but not in the DC record since the DC record contained more supplemental information.

International Metadata Initiatives: Lessons in Bibliographic Control. Priscilla Caplan. 2000.

Because this last resource's topic dealt with bibliographic control and the "explosion of metadata schemes" in the past decade on the World Wide Web, locating metadata information was simple. Everything was contained in the HTML source code and, conveniently, at the bottom of the webpage. No problems were encountered.

Summary and Conclusion

All the resources that are discussed in this paper are web-based in part or in full. The "anchoring story" element sets for the ERC records were, for the most part, more easily identified than the element sets for the DC records. As was indicated in the discussion, questions regarding the accuracy and reliability of some of the information contained in the records should be addressed and a "mechanism" or method, whether artificial or human, should be investigated to ensure a reasonable degree of confidence in the metadata information. Because enforcing the adoption of any metadata scheme is nearly impossible, an automated "metadata creator", for lack of a better term, should be devised. A good example of this would be a "born on" or "modified" date stamp similar to an operating systems file structure. With it, an "anchoring story" could be automatically generated using the ERC metadata scheme, supplying the information object with the necessary "who", "what", "when" and "there" from which qualifiers could be then be included by the creator to supplement the record.

While the two metadata schemes used in this assignment, ERC and DC, use different element sets to represent a particular resource or entity, both were designed for the purpose of representing information objects. As this assignment illustrated, each metadata scheme has advantages and disadvantages over the other, but the use of one over the other depends, ultimately, upon the success of an information seeker to accurately locate and retrieve a desired information object.